We are writing on behalf of thousands of Canadians, First Nations representatives, and other concerned organizations regarding the implications of the catastrophic failure of the tailings dam at the Mount Polley mine in British Columbia in August 2014, and the implications for tailings dam design and operational safety at mines throughout Canada.

Based on the findings and recommendations of the Independent Expert Review Panel\(^1\) of the Mount Polley tailings dam failure – the biggest in Canadian history – we urge Energy & Mines Ministers from all provinces and territories in Canada to take immediate measures to assess and prevent the threat posed by similar tailings disposal sites at existing and proposed mines in Canada.

\(^1\) https://www.mountpolleyreviewpanel.ca/final-report

---

**Canadian Energy & Mines Ministers**
- Hon. Bill Bennett, British Columbia Minister of Energy & Mines
- Hon. Margaret McCuaig-Boyd, Alberta Minister of Energy
- Hon. Bill Boyd, Saskatchewan Minister of Energy and Resources
- Hon. Dave Chomiak, Manitoba Minister of Mineral Resources
- Hon. Michael Gravelle, Ontario Minister of Northern Development and Mines
- Hon. Pierre Arcand & Luc Blanchette, Quebec Ministers of Energy, Mines & Natural Resources
- Hon. Donald Arseneault, New Brunswick Minister of Energy and Mines
- Hon. Derrick Dalley, Newfoundland Minister of Natural Resources
- Hon. Monica Ell, Nunavut Minister of Energy & Mines
- Hon. Michael Miltenberger, Northwest Territories Minister of Environment & Natural Resources
- Hon. Scott Kent, Yukon Minister of Energy, Mines & Resources

c/o Anna Bailie, Denis Simard, Jena Léger-Gendron

Coordinators of the Canadian Energy & Mines Ministers’ Conference

E-mail: Info@scics.gc.ca, anna.bailie@nrcan-rncan.gc.ca, Denis.Simard@scics.gc.ca, gena.legergendron@novascotia.ca

**Re: Changes needed to mine waste management following Mount Polley tailings site failure**

Dear Canadian Energy & Mines Ministers,

We are writing on behalf of thousands of Canadians, First Nations representatives, and other concerned organizations regarding the implications of the catastrophic failure of the tailings dam at the Mount Polley mine in British Columbia in August 2014, and the implications for tailings dam design and operational safety at mines throughout Canada.

---

\(^1\) https://www.mountpolleyreviewpanel.ca/final-report
In January 2015, a Panel of independent experts released its findings from its investigation of the Mount Polley tailings dam failure, a modern impoundment that breached and released over 24 billion litres of solid and liquid mining wastes (tailings) into the surrounding salmon-bearing lakes and rivers. The full extent of impacts and damages caused by this massive failure are still being assessed and could last for decades. Overall direct and indirect costs are climbing in the hundreds of millions of dollars to date, in addition to a steep cost on the industry’s reputation and public trust.

The Panel concluded that the dam failed because of a faulty design that didn’t account for the instability of the glacial till on which it was constructed. The failure and its effects were also exacerbated by unsafe operational practices, including storage of excess water in and on top of the tailings, as well as over-steep dam slopes. The Panel also concluded that the technology itself – wet tailings contained by large dams – was fundamentally and unacceptably dangerous.

The results of the Mount Polley investigation are of significant importance to mine management all across Canada for a number of reasons:

- Like the Mount Polley mine, there are many proposed and existing mines in Canada that are similarly located on potentially unstable foundation materials and/or using large dams and water cover for tailings disposal.
- Long term safety and stability of tailings disposals is a crucial public and environmental safety issue, yet there are no independent agencies responsible for oversight of tailings sites.
- Costs of tailings failures are enormous, both environmentally and economically, and current regulations are not up to speed with best available technologies to prevent them; proper contingency plans and appropriate financial assurance are also lacking.

The Independent Expert Review Panel firmly rejected any notion “that business as usual can continue,” and urged the industry and all regulators to change the way mining tailings facilities are designed, operated, and regulated in order to avoid any future failures: “The Panel does not accept the concept of a tolerable failure rate for tailings dams. To do so, no matter how small, would institutionalize failure. First Nations will not accept this, the public will not permit it, government will not allow it, and the mining industry will not survive.” The Panel identified critical risk factors and made a number of key recommendations, including:

- Creating Independent Tailings Review Boards (ITRBs) to evaluate tailings facilities’ safety.
- Using Best Available Technology (BAT) that fundamentally shifts tailings storage away from tailings ponds that store water to dry tailings, such as recommendations to:
  - Eliminate surface water from the impoundment,
  - Promote unsaturated conditions in the tailings with drainage provisions, and
  - Achieve dilatant conditions throughout the tailings deposit by compaction.

---

• Evaluating tailings facilities for these potential failure modes:
  a. Undrained shear failure for dams with silt and clay foundation soils.
  b. Water balance adequacy, including provisions and contingencies for wet years.
  c. Filter adequacy, especially for dams containing broadly graded soils or mine waste.
• Applying design, construction and safety standards developed specifically for tailings dams, rather than adapting those used for water retention dams.
• Maintaining a detailed tailings dams and facilities inventory database readily accessible for the public and potentially affected communities.
• Permitting tailings facilities based on a bankable feasibility with a detailed evaluation of all potential failure modes and management for all residual risks, “including a detailed cost/benefit analyses of best available technologies for tailings and closure options, recognizing that the results of the cost/benefit analyses should not supersede BAT safety considerations.”

In the wake of the Mount Polley disaster and the Expert Panel report, the British Columbia government has called for an immediate investigation of the safety of all 123 tailings dams within the province, and recently appointed a Mining Code Review Committee to determine how best to implement the Panel’s recommendations. In the words of the B.C. Mine Minister Bill Bennett: “It is up to us to ensure that we take a leadership role in Canada and internationally to learn from the Mount Polley incident and do everything we can to ensure it never happens again.”4 The potential for tailings site failures anywhere, including transboundary effects of upstream tailings spills, are also a concern, and the United States and international authorities are also being pressed for parallel commitments.5

Consequently, we urge all Energy & Mines Ministers to:

1. Work together to support and implement all of the Mount Polley Independent Expert Review Panel’s recommendations to avoid any future similar catastrophic tailings failure in Canada;
2. Take immediate measures to assess the safety of existing and proposed tailings sites in each of the provinces and territories, and maintain an inventory of sites and review results accessible to public;
3. Create Independent Tailings Review Boards, including International Joint Commission reviews for transboundary mines located on the Canada-U.S. border that present a risk to either country’s waters.
4. Recognize that there are certain places where the downstream values are too great to expose to the risks associated with the disposal of tailings sites that must be maintained in perpetuity.

We look forward to your response and welcome the opportunity for a more detailed discussion on these matters.

Sincerely,

Signed:6

---

4 https://news.gov.bc.ca/stories/government-appoints-mining-code-review-committee-members
5 https://www.earthworksaction.org/media/detail/obama_administration_must_act_to_avoid_mine_waste_disasters
6 Organized per province & territory (West to East), then per organizational name (alphabetical)
Dave Porter  
Executive Director  
BC First Nations Energy & Mining Council  
British Columbia, Canada

Bob Peart  
Executive Director  
Sierra Club BC  
British Columbia, Canada

Rod Marining  
Chair of Board of Directors  
British Columbia Environmental Network  
British Columbia, Canada

Theodora Carroll  
Coordinator  
Squamish Environment Society  
British Columbia, Canada

Warren Bell  
Founding President  
Canadian Association of Physicians for the Environment  
British Columbia, Canada

Grand Chief Stewart Phillip  
President  
Union of BC Indian Chiefs  
British Columbia, Canada

Dan Lewis  
Executive Director  
Clayoquot Action  
British Columbia, Canada

Aaron Hill  
Executive Director  
Watershed Watch Salmon Society  
British Columbia, Canada

John Werring  
Senior Science and Policy Advisor  
David Suzuki Foundation  
British Columbia, Canada

Karen Weingeist  
Coordinator  
Coalition for a Clean Green Saskatchewan  
Saskatchewan, Canada

Amy Crook  
Executive Director  
Fair Mining Collaborative  
British Columbia, Canada

Debbie Mihalicz  
Spokesperson  
Committee for Future Generations  
Saskatchewan, Canada

Douglas N. Gook  
Director  
Forest Protection Allies (FORPA)  
British Columbia, Canada

Elaine Hughes  
Coordinator  
Council of Canadians - Quill Plains Chapter  
Saskatchewan, Canada

Joe Daniels  
Riverkeeper  
Fraser Riverkeeper  
British Columbia, Canada

Michael Poellet  
Chairperson  
Inter-Church Uranium Committee Educational Co-operative (ICUCEC)  
Saskatchewan, Canada

Nikki Skuce  
Project Director  
Northern Confluence  
British Columbia, Canada

Steve Lawrence  
Director  
P.A. Renewable Power Intelligent Choice (RPIC)  
Saskatchewan, Canada

Norah Bowman  
Chair of Interdisciplinary Studies  
Okanagan College  
British Columbia, Canada

Alex Neve  
Secretary General  
Amnesty International Canada  
Ontario, Canada

Chris Blake  
Project Manager  
Quesnel River Watershed Alliance  
British Columbia, Canada

Éric Hébert-Daly  
National Executive Director  
Canadian Parks & Wilderness Society (CPAWS)  
Ontario, Canada
Beatrice Olivastri  
Chief Executive Officer  
Friends of the Earth Canada  
Ontario, Canada

Chaitanya Kalevar  
Spokesperson  
Just One World  
Ontario, Canada

Jennifer Henry  
Executive Director  
KAIROS: Canadian Ecumenical Justice Initiatives  
Ontario, Canada

Christina Moreau  
President  
Kipawa Lake Preservation Society  
Ontario, Canada

Rachel Small  
Member-Campaigner  
Mining Injustice Solidarity Network  
Ontario, Canada

Ugo Lapointe  
Canadian Program Coordinator  
MiningWatch Canada  
Ontario, Canada

Brennain Lloyd  
Director  
Northwatch  
Ontario, Canada

Joan Kuyek  
Chair  
Ontarians for a Just and Accountable Mineral Strategy (OJAMS)  
Ontario, Canada

Richard Girard  
Executive Director  
Polaris Institute  
Ontario, Canada

Adele Finney  
Executive Director  
Primate’s World Release and Development Fund  
Ontario, Canada

Judith Deutsch  
Director  
Science for Peace  
Ontario, Canada

Henri Jacob  
President  
Action boréale  
Quebec, Canada

Gordon Edwards  
President  
Canadian Coalition for Nuclear Responsibility  
Quebec, Canada

Dominique Bernier  
Coordinator  
Coalition pour que le Québec ait meilleure mine  
Quebec, Canada

Nicolas Soumis  
Spokesperson  
Comité Mine de rien de St-Camille  
Quebec, Canada

Amelie Orellana  
Coordinator  
Comité pour les droits humains en Amérique latine (CDHAL)  
Quebec, Canada

Nicole Krouac  
Lawyer & spokesperson  
Comité vigilance de Malartic  
Quebec, Canada

Alain Saladius  
Executive Director  
Fondation Rivières  
Quebec, Canada

Guy Côté  
Coordinator  
Groupe de théologie contextuelle québécoise (GTCQ)  
Quebec, Canada

Denise Brunelle  
Coordinator  
Groupe Solidarité Justice  
Quebec, Canada

Sylvie Van Brabant  
Director  
Rapide-Blanc Productions  
Quebec, Canada

Lise Lebrun  
Coordinator  
Regroupement Justice/Environnement des Sœurs de Sainte-Croix  
Quebec, Canada
Louise Gagnon  
Spokesperson  
Regroupement pour la Sauvegarde de la Grande Baie de Sept-Îles  
Quebec, Canada

Raymond Desrochers  
Coordinator  
Réseau œcuménique justice et paix (ROJeP)  
Quebec, Canada

Marc Fafard  
Spokesperson  
Sept-Îles Sans Uranium  
Quebec, Canada

Jacques Gélineau  
Spokesperson  
Société pour vaincre la pollution  
Quebec, Canada

Sharon Murphy  
Coordinator  
PEACE-NB  
New Brunswick, Canada

Jackie McVicar  
Coordinator  
Maritimes-Guatemala Breaking the Silence Solidarity Network  
Nova Scotia

Roberta Frampton Benefiel  
Vice-President  
Grand Riverkeeper Labrador Inc.  
Labrador, Canada

Sue Moodie  
Coordinator  
Council for Public Health in Mining Communities  
Yukon, Canada

Dale Kelley  
Executive Director  
Alaska Trollers Association  
Alaska, USA

Malena Marvin  
Executive Director  
Southeast Alaska Conservation Council  
Alaska, USA

Wendy Russell  
Coordinator  
Patagonia Area Resource Alliance  
Arizona, USA

Gary Macfarlane  
Ecosystem Defense Director  
Friends of the Clearwater  
Indiana, USA

Mary Costello  
Executive Director  
Rock Creek Alliance  
Indiana, USA

Timothy Judson  
Executive Director  
Nuclear Information and Resource Service  
Maryland, USA

Lori Andresen  
Director  
Save Our Sky Blue Waters,  
Minnesota, USA

Ivan Weber  
Principal/Owner  
Weber Sustainability Consulting  
Utah, USA

Jennifer Krill  
Executive Director  
EARTHWORKS  
Washington, USA

David Kliegman  
Executive Director  
Okanogan Highlands Alliance  
Washington, USA

Will Patric  
Executive Director  
Rivers Without Borders  
Washington, USA

Al Gedicks  
Director  
Center for Alternative Mining Development Policy  
Wisconsin, USA