Safety First
Guidelines for Responsible Mine Tailings Management

JUNE 2020

Report available at earthworks.org/safety-first and miningwatch.ca/safety-first

AUTHORS
This report was written by Earthworks (Jan Morrill and Payal Sampat) and MiningWatch Canada (Ugo Lapointe and Jamie Kneen), with contributions from Dr. Ann Maest (Buka Environmental), Dr. Dave Chambers (Center for Science in Public Participation), Dr. Steve Emerman (Malach Consulting), Dr. Bruno Milanez (Grupo Política, Economia, Mineração, Ambiente e Sociedade/Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora). — This report was written using publicly available data and interviews. The information contained herein is believed to be accurate but does not purport to be complete.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS
Thank you to Cathal Doyle, Emily Greenspan, Gavin Mudd, Lisa Sumi, Cindy Charleyboy, Loretta Williams, Catherine Coumans and Andrés Ángel (Scientific Advisor at AIDA) for reviewing this document.

COVER PHOTOS AND DESIGN
Cover photo: Workers from the Brazilian Ministry of Environment survey the catastrophic damage after the collapse of the Vale tailings dam in Brumadinho, Brazil, in 2019. Minas Gerais, Brazil. By IBAMA from Brazil.

Contributors and Endorsement pages photo: Tailings dam at the Red Chris mine operated by Imperial Metals, British Columbia, Canada. By Garth Lenz ©Garth-Lenz-1486 (courtesy of Salmon Beyond Borders).

Graphic Design by CreativeGeckos.com

TO CITE THIS REPORT

TO ENDORSE
To endorse Safety First: Guidelines for Responsible Mine Tailings Management or to provide comments on the Guidelines please email info@miningwatch.ca or info@earthworks.org
Organizations endorsing these recommendations

Aberdeen Neighbourhood Association – British Columbia, Canada
Action Boréale – Québec, Canada
ACWA / Earth Island Institute – Alaska, USA
Aksi Ekoologi & Emansipasi Rakyat (AEER) – Indonesia
Amazon Watch – USA
Amnesty International Canada – British Columbia, Canada
Anthropocene Alliance – USA
Arizona Mining Reform Coalition – Arizona, USA
Association pour la Protection du Lac Taureau (APLT) – Québec, Canada
Atlantic Salmon Federation – Nova Scotia, Canada
Bank Information Center – British Columbia, Canada
Banking Information Center – Washington, DC, USA
BC Mining Law Reform Network – British Columbia, Canada
Bench Marks Foundation – Southern Africa
Campbell River Environmental Committee – British Columbia, Canada
Canadian Environmental Law Association – Ontario, Canada
Canadian Environmental Law Association – Yukon, Canada
Canadian Parks & Wilderness Society (CPAWS-QC) – Québec, Canada
CATAPA – Belgium
Center for Science in Public Participation – Montana, USA
Centre de recherche en éducation et formation relatives à l’environnement (CentrERE) – Québec, Canada
Centre for Research on Latin America and the Caribbean (York University) – Ontario, Canada
Coalition des Opposants a un Projet minier en Haute-Matane (COPHM) – Québec, Canada
Coalition Quebec Meilleure Mine – Québec, Canada
Coalition to Save the Menominee River – Michigan & Wisconsin, USA
Collectif scientifique sur la question du gaz de schiste et les enjeux énergétiques au Québec – Québec, Canada
Comité Ambiental en Defensa de la Vida – Colombia
Comité citoyen de protection de l’esker – Québec, Canada
Comité pour les droits humains en Amérique Latine (CDHAL) – Québec, Canada
Concerned Citizens of Quesnel Lake – British Columbia, Canada
Conservation Northwest – Washington, USA
ContraMINAcción – Galicia, Spain
COORDINACIÓ – Galicia, Spain
COOPERACIÓ – Peru
Council of Canadians (Atlantic) – Nova Scotia, Canada
CPAWS Yukon – Yukon, Canada
David Suzuki Foundation – Québec, Canada
E-Tech International – New Mexico, USA
Earthjustice, USA
Earth Law Center – USA
Earthworks – USA
Eau Secours – Québec, Canada
Ecology Action Centre – Nova Scotia, Canada
Ecology Center – Michigan, USA
Environmental Defence – Canada
Estonian Forest Aid (Eesti Metsa Abiks) – Estonia
Fair Mining Collaborative – British Columbia, Canada
First Nations Women Advocating Responsible Mining – Canada
Foundation Rivières – Québec, Canada
Friends of the Earth Canada – Canada
Froján Community ICCA – Galicia, Spain
Fundación Montescolsa – Galicia, Spain
Fundación Tantí – Observatorio Plurinacional de Salares Andinos – Chile
Goa Foundation – India
Goenchi Mat Movement – India
Great Basin Resource Watch – Nevada, USA
Greenpeace Brasil – Brazil
GRUFIDES – Cajamarca, Perú
Grupo de Estudos e Pesquisas Socioambientais (GEPSA) – Minas Gerais, Brazil
Grupo de Pesquisa e Extensão Política, Economia, Mineração, Ambiente e Sociedade (PoEMAS) – Brazil
Headwaters Montana – Montana, USA
Igapo Project – France
Industrial & All Global Union – Switzerland
Information Network for Responsible Mining – Colorado, USA
Instituto Políticas Alternativas para o Cone Sul (PACS) – Rio de Janeiro, Brazil
Instituto Socioambiental (ISA), Universidade Federal de São Carlos (UFSCar) – Peru, Brazil
Interamerican Association for Environmental Defense (IADE) – Colombia
Junta de Comunidades de Madrid – Schima, Spain
KAIROS Halifax – Nova Scotia, Canada
Kamloops Area Preservation Association (KAPA) – British Columbia, Canada
LEAD Agency – Oklahoma, USA
London Mining Network – United Kingdom
Malach Consulting – Utah, USA
Menkanaaehem Inc. – Wisconsin, USA
MICO – Tanzania
Mineral Policy Institute (MPI) – Australia
Mining Impact Coalition of Wisconsin – Wisconsin, USA
Mining Injustice Solidarity Network – Canada
Mining Watch Romania – Romania
MiningWatch Canada – Canada
mm&P (mines, minerals & PEOPLE) – India
Movimiento de los Atingidos e das Atingidas por Barragem (MAB) – Brazil
Multicultural Alliance for a Safe Environment – New Mexico, USA
Municipality of Grenville-sur-la-Rouge – Québec, Canada
Natural Resources Defense Council – USA
Nature Québec – Québec, Canada
Naturværnforbundet – Friends of the Earth Norway - Mining Group – Norway
Northern Confluence Initiative – British Columbia, Canada
Northwatch – Ontario, Canada
Nova Scotia Salmon Association – Nova Scotia, Canada
Observatoire d’Etudes et d’Appui à la Responsabilité Sociale et Environnementale – Democratic Republic of the Congo
Okanogan Highlands Alliance – Washington, USA
Ontarios for Just & Accountable Mineral Strategy (OJAMS) – Ontario, Canada
Oxfam America – USA
Plataforma Vecinal Mina Touro – O Pino NON – Galicia, Spain
Progressive Leadership Alliance of Nevada (PLAN) – Nevada, USA
Project on Organizing, Development, Education, and Research (PODER) – Mexico
Rainforest Action Group – Australia & Ecuador
Respecting Aboriginal Values and Environmental Needs (RAVEN) – British Columbia, Canada
REVIMAT – Québec, Canada
Rivers Without Borders – Alaska, USA
Rock Creek Alliance – Mountain States, USA
Salmon Without Borders – Alaska, USA & British Columbia, Canada
Salva la Selva – Spain
Save Our Cabins – Mountain States, USA
Save Our Seas and Shores Coalition – Nova Scotia, Canada
Save the South Fork Salmon – Idaho, USA
Sierra Club Canada – Canada
Sierra Club USA – USA
South East Alaska Indigenous Transboundary Commission (SEITC) – Alaska, USA
Southwest Research and Information Center – USA
St. Mary’s River Association – Nova Scotia, Canada
Sustainable Northern Nova Scotia Society – Nova Scotia, Canada
The Andrew Lees Trust – United Kingdom
The Friends of the Stikine Society – British Columbia, Canada
The Future We Need – International
The Gaia Foundation – Europe
The Lands Council – Washington, USA
Thompson Institute of Environmental Studies – British Columbia, Canada
Union of BC Indian Chiefs – Turtle Island, Canada
Upper Peninsula Environmental Coalition – Michigan, USA
Verdegà – Galicia, Spain
Vida e Ria de Minaria – Galicia, Spain
Weber Sustainability Consulting – Utah, USA
West Coast Development Foundation – Papua New Guinea
Wilderness Committee – British Columbia, Canada
Wildsight – British Columbia, Canada
Wilp Luutkudziiwus Nation – Gitxsan Laxyip, British Columbia, Canada
Wisconsin Resources Protection Council – Wisconsin & Michigan, USA
Yes to Life No to Mining – Latin America
Yukon Conservation Society – Yukon, Canada

To endorse Safety First: Guidelines for Responsible Mine Tailings Management, email us:
info@miningwatch.ca or info@earthworks.org
Executive Summary

The 2019 mine tailings dam collapse near Brumadinho, Brazil, killed over 250 people and decimated houses and buildings for kilometers before flowing into the Paraopeba River. The catastrophe stunned the world, but should not have come as a surprise. Tailings facilities, which contain the processed waste materials generated from mining metals and minerals, are failing with increasing frequency and severity.

Current industry standards, including the draft of the Global Tailings Standard released in 2019, do not go far enough to adequately protect communities and ecosystems from failures. The design, construction, operation and closure of tailings facilities require significant changes to protect people and the environment.

The safest tailings facility is the one that is not built. To avoid the long-term liability of mine waste sites and their social and environmental impacts, we must reduce the volume of tailings produced, as well as the overall demand for primary raw minerals. Over the past 40 years, ore grades have declined on average by half for many minerals, effectively doubling the volume of mine waste tailings generated for each unit of mineral produced. Current trends suggest an additional 2- to 10-fold increase in the extraction and uses of most minerals by 2060. These trends are not sustainable. We need to continue to mine at least some minerals, including to support energy transition technologies, but we need best standards and practices to do so.

Tailings facilities can fail in many ways and with varying degrees of severity. This document outlines guidelines aimed at preventing catastrophic failures: failures where the structural integrity of the storage facility has been compromised.

The ultimate goal of tailings management must be zero harm to people and the environment and zero tolerance for human fatalities. Operating companies must commit to and document that they have made safety the primary consideration in tailings facilities and dam design, construction, operation, closure and post-closure. If an operating company identifies any potential loss of life as a
result of a tailings dam failure, the dam must be designed to withstand the most extreme credible meteorological and seismic events.

Prior to permitting approval and over the life of the mine, operating companies must ensure the meaningful engagement, participation and consent of affected and potentially affected communities for any tailings facility.

The use of upstream dams must be banned in favor of centerline and downstream dams, which are much less vulnerable to all mechanisms of dam failure. Additionally, dams must not be built in close proximity to communities or above mining infrastructure where workers are likely to be present.

Design, construction, operation and closure at any tailings facility must all be subject to the best available technologies and best available practices. This would encourage the use of filtered tailings, which reduce the probability and consequence of failure.

Operating companies must document detailed understanding of the dam foundation as well as the tailings material properties, with special attention to clay content and liquefaction potential. There must be annual reporting that verifies that dam operations and construction adheres to the documented dam design.

Tailings facilities must be reviewed, inspected, monitored, and maintained until they reach a permanent state where the potential for failure is essentially impossible. The initial storage of filtered tailings facilitates an eventual safe closure.

Worst-case tailings failure scenarios must be modeled and made public prior to permitting and regularly updated throughout facility lifecycles. Emergency and evacuation drills related to catastrophic failure of tailings facilities must be held on an annual basis, and their planning and execution must include participation from affected communities, workers, local authorities and emergency management.

A culture of safety and responsibility must be upheld at the highest level within a corporation; this can only be achieved if the Board of Directors is held accountable for its actions (or lack thereof). The Board of Directors must bear the prime responsibility for the safety of tailings facilities, including the consequences of dam failures, and demonstrate that the company has the necessary financial assurance to cover the full cost of closure and post-closure plans as well as public liability insurance to cover the full cost of any catastrophic failures.

Aerial view of mine waste, Catalão, Goiás, Brazil. Photo: Júlia Pontés.
SUMMARY OF GUIDELINES

- Make safety the guiding principle in design, construction, operation, and closure
- Ban new mine tailings facilities immediately upstream from inhabited areas
- Ban upstream dams at new mines and close existing upstream facilities
- Any potential loss of life is an extreme event and design must respond accordingly
- Mandate the use of Best Available Technology for tailings, including the use of filtered tailings, and implement rigorous controls for safety, including after mine closure
- Demonstrate understanding of local conditions and tailings characteristics with robust monitoring systems and develop emergency preparedness/response plans
- Affected communities must provide consent, and safety oversight must be independent, including the establishment of grievance procedures and whistleblower protections
- Information regarding mine safety must be made publicly available
- Corporate boards must assume full responsibility for risk (including financial risk) and accept the consequences of failure

In order to understand how and why failures occur, we must understand the scope of the issue. There is currently no global inventory of the thousands of tailings storage facilities, or a complete registry of dam failures. Compiling and sharing this information, publicly and transparently, is essential. An independent international agency, such as a United Nations-endorsed agency, in collaboration with responsible States, operating companies, and civil society, must drive this process, collect information on tailings dams and tailings dam failures worldwide, and share it with affected communities in order to de-risk these sites and support work to put in place proper emergency action plans.

Ultimately, this nascent international agency must be able to oversee tailings management safety worldwide. It must be a well-resourced agency capable of efficiently updating global standards, certifying their implementation, investigating failures and making publicly available recommendations. In order to determine the reach and scope of such an agency, an independent study should investigate which governance model would be most appropriate for this task.

**Language**

This document uses the word “must” to indicate an action or guideline that is required. The word “should” is used when the action or guideline is optional or unattainable at this time.