Putting the Public First

How CDPHE can overcome its legacy of prioritizing oil and gas industry interests ahead of public health, safety, welfare and the environment

MARCH 2020
Putting the Public First

How CDPHE can overcome its legacy of prioritizing oil and gas industry interests ahead of public health, safety, welfare and the environment

MARCH 2020

Report available at earthworks.org/CDPHE-transparency

CONTRIBUTORS AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Author – Nathalie Eddy
Contributors – Bruce Baizel, Alan Septoff, and Nadia Steinzor

Acknowledgments – This report was made possible in part with support from the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation, Sacharuna Foundation, and The New-Land Foundation, Inc

COVER PHOTOS AND DESIGN

Cover photo by Earthworks
Graphic Design by CreativeGeckos.com
## Table of Contents

1. Introduction........................................................................................................................................................................4

2. AQCC Decisions Mark a New Era Centered on Protecting People.................................................................5

3. Confusing and Inefficient Complaint Tools Hamstring Protection of Public Health.............................................6
   - Chart: CDPHE Response to 65 Oil & Gas Complaints.................................................................................................6
   - Scorecard: How Well Do Colorado’s Oil & Gas Complaint Tools Respond to and Inform the Public? ...............................................................................................................................................7
   - Colorado Oil & Gas Growth Exceeds CDPHE Enforcement Capacity..........................................................8
   - Table: Colorado 2019 Oil & Gas Inspection Capacity.................................................................................................8

4. Earthworks’ Community Empowerment Project.................................................................................................9
   - Earthworks’ Request for 2019 Oil & Gas Complaints Received by CDPHE ..................................................10

5. Conclusions and Recommendations .........................................................................................................................11
   - Incremental Changes are Not Enough – It is time to end CDPHE’s legacy of protecting polluters at the expense of public health and safety.................................................................11
   - Key Recommendations to Protect Coloradans from Oil & Gas
     - Allocate Resources to CDPHE to transform the CDPHE oil and gas complaint system and hire an oil and gas community liaison..................................................................................11
     - Keep the public informed about the investigation and outcome of every oil and gas complaint.......................................................................................................................................11
     - Integrate Colorado’s oil and gas complaint systems.................................................................................................11

Endnotes ..............................................................................................................................................................................12
Introduction

Over generations the state of Colorado built and perpetuated a regulatory system and culture prioritizing oil and gas industry interests ahead of all others. The Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment (CDPHE) was no exception.

The 2019 passage of Senate Bill 19-181 signaled a landmark change: it directed state agencies to prioritize public health and safety. Consequently, the system created to foster Colorado’s oil and gas industry must be rebuilt to serve the public first.

“Rebuilt” is not hyperbole. This report illustrates the inadequacy and opacity of CDPHE’s current procedures to protect the public.

Bolstered by recent Air Quality Control Commission (AQCC) rulemaking decisions, the time is ripe for CDPHE to remake its approach to oil and gas oversight – prioritizing transparency, community voices and industry accountability for the pollution and harm it causes.
AQCC Decisions Mark a New Era
Centered on Protecting People

How the state agencies carry out their mandates under SB-181 can be seen in the recent and ongoing rulemakings for both the Colorado Oil & Gas Conservation Commission (COGCC) and CDPHE. While the COGCC will implement the most sweeping changes, CDPHE is responsible for issuing and enforcing oil and gas air permits, and for protecting residents living near oil and gas operations. Fortunately, the AQCC recently adopted two provisions responding directly to public health and safety concerns.

1. To increase transparency and accountability, the Commission further directs that in 2020 the Division explore options for developing a publicly accessible and searchable oil and gas complaint filing and tracking tool, and to accept public input on the development of this tool. The Division will report back to the Commission on its progress in 2020.

2. Beginning calendar year 2020, owners or operators of well production facilities with estimated uncontrolled actual VOC [Volatile Organic Compound] emissions greater than or equal to two (2) tons per year, based on a rolling twelve-month total, and located within 1,000 feet of an occupied area must inspect components for leaks [on a quarterly or monthly basis].

CDPHE should carry out its mandate by creating public tools, services and information ordinary Coloradans can use and trust. Ordinary Coloradans must include the stressed parent juggling a full-time job, child-care, and after school activities. They must include the retiree who sees something at a well pad and seeks information about VOC exposures. They must include every Coloradan who wants to breathe clean air.

An effective oil and gas regulatory regime—one that both combats pollution and protects the public—requires a transparent and easily accessible oil and gas complaint system. Such a robust complaint system is central to measuring progress and success in:

- Minimizing methane and Volatile Organic Compound (VOC) pollution
- Protecting public health, safety, welfare and the environment
- Providing a way for the public to hold agencies accountable to their mandates
- Fostering greater trust in agencies that work with industry and serve the public
- Being responsive to community concerns
- Increasing government efficiency
Confusing and Inefficient Complaint Tools Hamstring Protection of Public Health

Impacted residents must cope with three oil and gas complaint systems

- COGCC online complaint tool.¹
- CDPHE Oil & Gas Health Information and Response program (OGHIR).²
- CDPHE – direct email to CDPHE’s Air Pollution Control Division (APCD) Oil & Gas Enforcement Team.³

Since January 2018, Earthworks has filed 65 complaints for oil and gas pollution in Colorado. As the COGCC and CDPHE complaint systems are not integrated and track different types of information, Earthworks filed each complaint in two or three places, depending on whether our staff noted odors and / or health impacts when they were in the field. This redundancy is necessary in order to:

- Create a transparent public-facing and publicly searchable complaint record (using the COGCC online complaint system)
- Address and record health impacts to a specific zip code (using the CDPHE OGHIR online system)
- Ensure the most swift and site-specific response possible from the Division’s oil and gas inspection team (by emailing the CDPHE Oil & Gas inspection team directly)

CDPHE Response to 65 Oil & Gas Complaints

Complaints filed by Earthworks over the last two years (most filed with multiple departments). The total number of responses exceeds 65 because some complaints had more than one CDPHE response.

31 Operator Contacted  20 Inspected  15 Ignored  9 Pending  7 Site Repaired  2 Lost  1 Violation with Penalty

CDPHE Response to 65 Oil & Gas Complaints

Complaints filed by Earthworks over the last two years (most filed with multiple departments). The total number of responses exceeds 65 because some complaints had more than one CDPHE response.
The scorecard below outlines different ways for Colorado communities to voice oil and gas related concerns and highlights critical gaps in CDPHE’s transparency and accountability.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORECARD</th>
<th>How Well Do Colorado’s Oil &amp; Gas Complaint Tools Respond to and Inform the Public?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public tools and information</td>
<td>CDPHE Oil and Gas Health Information and Response program (OGHIR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF COMPLAINT SUBMISSION TOOLS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centralized complaint database</td>
<td>Yes – for health-related complaints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publicly facing</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAQ / how-to guide</td>
<td>Health / non-health concern is confusing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Searchable by public</td>
<td>With limitations$^a$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of updates</td>
<td>Irregularly$^{11}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INFORMATION TRACKED AND PUBLICLY AVAILABLE FOR EACH COMPLAINT SUBMITTED</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operator name</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site name</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of complainant</td>
<td>No$^{13}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date the complaint was filed</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description of the emissions / full complaint text submitted</td>
<td>No (type of health symptom may be included)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does the complaint include a health-related concern? (Y / N)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complaint tracking #</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulator response recorded / tracked</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspection report (if available)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspector name</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response from operator</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of the complaint (is it pending or closed)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of closure of the complaint (if applicable)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome (did the complaint result in a violation or penalty?)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>REGULAR ENFORCEMENT REPORTS (ANNUAL / REGULAR)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency Annual Complaint report</td>
<td>Not since Nov 2017$^{14}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All annual reports available on-line</td>
<td>Two annual reports from 2016 and 2017 available$^{17}$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Colorado Oil & Gas Growth Exceeds CDPHE Enforcement Capacity

While the number of oil and gas facilities and air emissions permits continues to grow in Colorado, the agency in charge of enforcing air permits and protecting public health and safety has not adequately expanded its capacity.

The scorecard on the previous page highlights the significant differences in the treatment of public complaint information regarding oil and gas concerns. The lack of integration of the oil and gas complaint tools leaves community members without information about oil and gas facilities in their neighborhoods, and fails to adequately or consistently respond to complaints if they are filed.

The proposed CDPHE APCD Enforcement Budget increase for 2020 is a critical opportunity for CDPHE to build a stronger oil and gas complaint system that will increase transparency, responsiveness to the public, and accountability of the industry. Most importantly, a strengthened CDPHE complaint tool will better protect public health and safety from the known dangerous health impacts of living in proximity to oil and gas facilities.20

The number of COGCC and CDPHE field inspectors are out-numbered and out- resourced by the growing number of active well sites and oil and gas emissions sources operating in Colorado. The challenge of CDPHE’s oil and gas inspection capacity below highlights the gap between the number of inspections conducted annually and the total number of emissions sources. Additional resources are needed to increase CDPHE’s capacity to respond to the public with information and hold the industry accountable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COLORADO 2019 OIL &amp; GAS INSPECTION CAPACITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td># of permits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COGCC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDPHE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Earthworks’ Community Empowerment Project

In 2014, Earthworks started the Community Empowerment Project (CEP) because oil and gas pollution puts people and the climate at risk, and regulators and industry have consistently minimized or ignored legitimate community complaints.

Methane pollution released by oil and gas facilities is 86 times more damaging to our climate than carbon dioxide over a 20-year time frame – longer than established climate science gives us to avoid the most catastrophic effects of climate change.

Oil and gas operations also release VOCs that cause a range of health problems, including carcinogens like benzene and toluene. This directly threatens the nearly 13 million US residents who live within a half mile radius of more than one million active oil and gas facilities.

CEP makes the invisible visible by capturing Optical Gas Imaging footage of oil and gas pollution, files complaints with regulatory agencies nationwide to drive industry and government accountability, and supports impacted community voices.
Earthworks’ Request for 2019 Oil & Gas Complaints Received by CDPHE

In an effort to request a status update on Earthworks’ pending complaints, on September 13, 2019 we filed a CORA (Colorado Open Records Act) request for a list and status update on all complaints filed in 2019. We immediately received a list of 205 health-related complaints filed with CDPHE OGHIR. The list of complaints includes city, zip code, complainant age and some descriptions of the symptoms experienced. However, in order to receive the full scope of the CORA request submitted, we would need to pay $242.24 to cover the staff time necessary to pull together the information. We submitted the $242.24 to CDPHE and received a complaint summary of 49 complaints (apparently different complaints from the list of 205 complaints we received previously). The summary spreadsheet was incomplete, inconsistent and non-responsive to the complete CORA request. The scanned-in complaint documents were difficult to navigate and inconsistently redacted personal information of the complainants.

What we learned:

• 18 of the 49 of the complaints were from Earthworks
• The complaint status (pending or closed) was not available
• Complaint details were incomplete and inconsistently redacted
• CDPHE does not have a tracking system for use even by its own staff
• CDPHE does not track the final outcome of complaints

Conclusion and Recommendations

Incremental Changes are Not Enough – It is time to end CDPHE’s legacy of protecting polluters at the expense of public health and safety

Because CDPHE oil and gas oversight systems were built without prioritizing protection of impacted residents, the public:

- Finds it difficult to engage CDPHE on their behalf
- Sees inaction from CDPHE in response to complaints filed
- Does not trust CDPHE to protect their health
- Has lost their patience with CDPHE
- Is scared of the health harms they face living near fracking
- Does not know who to turn to for help when they have a health concern about an oil and gas site
- Is not provided any information following oil and gas fires near their homes

Key Recommendations to Protect Coloradans from Oil & Gas

Allocate resources to CDPHE in order to

- Transform the CDPHE oil and gas complaint system
- Hire an oil and gas community liaison

Keep the public informed about the investigation and outcome of every oil and gas complaint

- Proactively respond to complainants so the concerned public is automatically informed and updated on the status of each complaint
- Create a publicly accessible map of all oil and gas complaints (with an option to download and search the data)
- Track the outcome of each complaint
- Release a summary report of all complaints, inspections and findings on a regular (at least quarterly) basis

Integrate Colorado’s oil and gas complaint systems

- Create a single complaint number that travels with the complaint regardless of the agency

“The [Air Pollution Control Division, APCD] needs this to make sure we can produce health benefits for Colorado residents.”
— Governor Jared Polis in reference to the CDPHE proposed budget increase

“My philosophy is that we hold polluters accountable. I think our enforcement actions, in general, need to be meaningful enough so that the industry has an incentive to put whatever controls are available to them in place to ensure [violations don’t] happen.”
— Jill Hunsaker Ryan, Executive Director, CDPHE


Per CDPHE information request submitted 8/5/19. 28,433 indicates the number of sources of oil and gas emissions for which CDPHE APCD issued air permits. As most permitted oil and gas sites include several APCD permitted sources of emissions, the number of individual oil and gas facilities is lower than 28,433.

2019 number of CDPHE APCD inspectors received from CDPHE staff with the APCD Oil and Gas Team. 2/10/20.

2019 inspection totals received from CDPHE staff with the APCD Oil and Gas Team. 2/10/20.


For each public complaint filed with CDPHE regarding oil and gas emissions in 2019, we requested the following information: (1) Operator name, (2) Site name, (3) Name of complainant, (4) Date the complaint was filed, (5) Description of the emissions, (6) Did the complaint include a health-related concern? (Y/N), (7) Response from APCD, (8) Inspection report (if available), (9) Inspector name, (10) Status of the complaint (is it pending or closed), (11) Date of closure of the complaint (if applicable), and (12) Outcome (did the complaint result in a violation or penalty?).
